

MacGillivray's Warbler. Drawing by Denis Kania.

'The specimen is a typical adult male MacGillivray's Warbler in all respects.'

An additional in-hand character for separating adult males of the two species seems not to have been mentioned in the literature. In MacGillivray's, the feathers of the chin between the mandibular rhami are usually white (38 specimens taken January to June, FMNH) and only rarely gray (three specimens, May-July, FMNH). This white patch may be only 1 mm wide (longitudinally) and requires a magnifying glass to discern; in most cases, however, it is obvious, occasionally reaching 4 mm in width. In Mourning, the entire chin is invariably gray, concolor with the throat (39 spring males, FMNH); in a few birds the gray feathers are narrowly tipped with white, but so are the throat feathers, so that the two areas are still concolor. The Lewistown bird has a well-developed white chin patch.

Hall (1979) showed that none of the classic plumage characteristics for adult males is diagnostic. In fact, of the Mourning specimens he examined, 40 of 177 (23%) had black lores, 4 of 80 (5%) had a few barely discernible feathers of a white eye arc, and, in the entire sample, the apron was found to be too variable to be useful. Pitocchelli (1990) agreed that Mournings can have various combinations of MacGillivray's-like plumage characters, but said that such individuals are rare; none of the Mournings he examined possessed all three of the most important characters of MacGillivray's - the eye crescents, black lores, and small wingminus-tail measurement. Thus it would seem that even adult male MacGillivray's Warblers cannot be separated safely from Mournings in the field, and that the wing-minustail measurement is the only reliable difference. However, we suspect that a very thorough study designed to illuminate field identification may show that certain combinations of extremes, such as a bird with strong eye crescents (not merely a few white feathers or a narrow even-width ring), black lores meeting widely over the bill, and total absence of a black apron, might allow identification of many individuals. The literature documents the degree of overlap within each character but has yet to discuss thoroughly the value of specific suites of characters. We have found no mention in the literature that MacGillivray's Warbler ever lacks white eye crescents or black lores, although the apron may be every bit as obvious as in Mourning (Hall 1979, pers. obs.); thus the absence of these two marks can (apparently) be used in field identification of vagrant Mournings in western North America.

We find no indication that the Lewistown bird might be mislabeled. The data on Strode's original label are hand-written (in the same hand as