

parallel to the pale edge of the fresh dorsum feathers," according to the reviewer. Also this bird is often vocal if flushed giving a trill-like call; this was not noted. In addition, the plumage detail failed to mention a basic "Spotted Sandpiper-type wash on the chest and shoulders." Meticulous detail and "harder evidence" are an absolute necessity for a record of this type. Apparently at least five experienced observers saw this bird?and only one documented it!

Mew Gull (*Larus canus*): One first-year bird at Montrose, Chicago COO 24 Jan (1998.005). The lack of a solidly dark brown tail and other soft part descriptive detail failed to convincingly eliminate a Ring-billed Gull in juvenile winter plumage.

California Gull (*Larus californicus*): One juvenile at the "Borrow Pit" MAD 11Oct-19 Dec (1998.058); an underappreciated concern is the the difficulty in assessing the different first-year plumages of Herring Gull that look like a first-year California Gull; this bird was photographed and the Committee had a national gull expert review the evidence. Basic shape (more filled in like a Herring Gull); bill a little thicker throughout and the reddish cast to the bill (not as contrasty fleshy pink in the bicolor—black/pink as in California) and finer points such as the more filled in scapulars (overall paler on California with dark center lines)—identified this bird as a first-year Herring Gull. "It is absolutely routine for first-year Herring Gulls to acquire pink at the bill base, sometimes in a pattern very similar to California. Though it was unusual for this much pink in mid-October," stated the reviewer. One at Clinton L. DEW 27-30 Sep (1998.075); because of the difficulty in eliminating a first-year Herring Gull without more concrete evidence—the Committee elected to not accept this identification; in addition the sketched provided failed to convincingly portray a first-year California Gull—particularly in the mantle and scapular sketches—plus the posture of the sketch seemed more like a juvenile Herring Gull.

Glaucous-winged Gull (*Larus glaucescens*): One first-year bird at Peoria Lock and Dam TAZ 26 Jan-1 Feb (1997.005); the description failed to adequately rule out hybrid gulls. It was indeed unfortunate that many other observers failed obtain supportive descriptive detail at the time of observation. One first-year bird at Lake Calumet area, Chicago COO 20 Feb (1998.007); again, the description failed to adequately rule out hybrid gulls and the distance of observation seemed to weigh against a convincing argument for acceptance.

Eurasian Collared-Dove (*Streptopelia decaocto*): One at Salt Creek, Ashwood Park, Palatine COO 2 May (1998.022); possibly correct but diagnostic plumage detail not completely described; the bird did not call. One

at Carrolton GRE 27 Aug (1998.051); likely correct but not enough plumage detail was described to eliminate a hybrid dove and the photo sent in to the Committee did not have the large image quality and sharpness needed to assess the plumage.

Scissor-tailed Flycatcher (*Tyrannus forficatus*): One at UNI Co. Refuge, South Blacktop UNI 17 May (1998.019); likely correct but the documentation nearly too minimal to evaluate. A few more plumage details in the sketch would have benefited this documentation.

Violet-green Swallow (*Tachycineta thalassina*): One at Lake Villa LAK 18 Jul (1997.048). A brief fly-by view without enough convincing key field marks for such a rarity.

Stonechat (*Saxicola torquata*) One at Wenmouth Road KNE 4 May (1998.020). For this record the Committee consulted an expert for the evaluation of this extraordinary bird record. Accordingly the flight characters as described were inconsistent with Stonechat. Stonechat has a "whirring flight" like a bumblebee. Size, posture, jizz, perching and feeding behavior as described were inconsistent with this species. Plumage detail was missing a contrasting white rump and the wing bars as described should have had a "white panel" not separated "wing-bars."

Kirtland's Warbler (*Dendroica kirtlandii*): One at West Du Page Woods DUP 14 May (1997.021); not enough plumage and behavioral detail for such a rare warbler.

Western Tanager (*Piranga ludoviciana*): One male at Arlington Heights COO 18 May (1997.007). Possibly correct but several key field marks including the black mantle were not noted. An account is in MJIB 6:140.

Brewer's Sparrow (*Spizella breweri*): One at Fermi DUP (1998.028); possibly correct; the pale gray underparts and complete eye-ring were very compelling for acceptance. However, the "buff" on the sides of the breast was a field mark generally not associated with Brewer's Sparrow. Several key descriptive elements were missing—including a description of the tail—this was, however, due to a rather brief look at this bird. The Committee ultimately felt that a delayed molting immature Clay-colored Sparrow could not be safely eliminated by the description; in addition, it would have helped had the other observers documented this very rare bird.

Black-headed Grosbeak (*Pheucticus melanocephalus*): One male at Downer's Grove DUP 10 May (1996.027); after much discussion and controversy the description was deemed too brief for such a rarity and the bill as described was incorrect for the species; a brief account is in MJIB 5:132.

Great-tailed Grackle (*Quiscalus mexicanus*): One adult male at Beardstown CAS 7 May (1997.008); Possi-